



REPORT

**Virtual Meeting
29 April 2014**

Technical Panel on Phytosanitary Treatments April 2014



Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations

CONTENTS

1. Opening of the Meeting	3
2. Update from Relevant Bodies.....	3
CPM-9 (2014).....	4
Technical Panel for the Glossary (TPG).....	5
3. TPPT Work Programme	6
4. Other Business	7
5. Close of the Meeting and Feedback.....	7

APPENDICES

Appendix 1: Agenda.....	8
Appendix 2: TPPT Work Programme	9

1. Opening of the Meeting

- [1] The IPPC Secretariat (hereafter Secretariat) welcomed the participants to the meeting and participants introduced themselves. The following persons participated in the meeting:

Mr Patrick GOMES (TPPT Member, USA)

Mr Michael ORMSBY (TPPT Member, New Zealand)

Mr Eduardo WILLINK (TPPT Member, Argentina)

Mr Guy HALLMAN (TPPT Member, USA)

Mr Artur SHAMILOV (IPPC Secretariat)

Ms Adriana MOREIRA (IPPC Secretariat)

Mr Andrew PARKER (TPPT Invited Expert, International Atomic Energy Agency (IAEA))

Mr Bart ROSSEL (Standards Committee (SC) Member, Steward)

- [2] The panel approved the agenda (Appendix 1) and Mr Michael ORMSBY was elected as rapporteur.

- [3] The Secretariat gave a brief overview presentation of the virtual meeting tool Adobe Connect¹.

2. Update from Relevant Bodies

SC e-decisions on treatments for Member Consultation (MC)

- [4] The Secretariat introduced the paper² and informed the participants that the TPPT recommended to the SC six draft treatments for the 2014 member consultation and these have now been approved by the SC via e-decisions. It was informed that some comments were made by the SC and these have been resolved by the treatment leads, accordingly.

- [5] The draft PTs (Annexes to ISPM 28) approved for the 2014 member consultation (01 July – 01 December 2014) were:

- High temperature forced air treatment for *Bactrocera melanotus* and *Bactrocera xanthodes* on *Carica papaya* (2009-105)
- Vapour heat treatment for *Carica papaya* var. *Solo* (2009-109)
- Cold treatment for *Ceratitidis capitata* on *Citrus clementina* var. *Clemenules* (2010-102)
- Cold treatment for *Ceratitidis capitata* on *Citrus sinensis* var. *Navel* and *Valencia-late* (2010-103)
- Vapour heat treatment for *Ceratitidis capitata* on *Mangifera indica* (2010-106)
- Irradiation for *Ostrinia nubilalis* (2012-009)

Letters to Submitters

- [6] It was informed that in April 2014 the Secretariat sent letters to treatment submitters, requesting further information and thinking successful submitters for their submissions. A comprehensive response was received from Australia on the subject Vapour heat treatment for *Bactrocera tryoni* on *Mangifera indica* (2010-107). Other submitters have not replied at this time.

- [7] The TPPT:

¹ 02_TPPT_2014_Apr

² 03_TPPT_2014_Apr

(1) *noted* the Secretariat update.

CPM-9 (2014)

[8] The Secretariat updated the panel on the Commission on Phytosanitary Measures (CPM)-9³ decisions as follow:

Adoption of International Standards for Phytosanitary Measures

[9] CPM adopted the Vapour heat treatment for *Bactrocera cucurbitae* (Melon Fly) on *Cucumis melo* var. *reticulatus* (2006-110) as an annex 15 of ISPM 28. The Secretariat thanked the panel for their efforts in getting this treatment adopted.

Revision of List of Topics for IPPC Standards

[10] The CPM added to the *List of Topics for IPPC Standards*⁴ the TPPT recommendation on the development of draft ISPMs for treatment requirements and the revision of ISPM 18 (*Guidelines for the use of irradiation as a phytosanitary measure*). The topics added to the list of topics and it will be developed under the TPPT work programme were as follow:

- Requirements for the use of chemical treatments as a phytosanitary measure (2014-003)
- Requirements for the use of fumigation as a phytosanitary measure (2014-004)
- Requirements for the use of temperature treatments as a phytosanitary measure (2014-005)
- Requirements for the use of modified atmosphere treatments as a phytosanitary measure (2014-006)
- Requirements for the use of irradiation as a phytosanitary measure (Revision to ISPM 18) (2014-007)

[11] The CPM also removed the particular topics for treatment submission allowing countries to submit any treatment during a treatment call. The topics deleted from the list of topics were as follow:

- Irradiation treatments (2006-014)
- Wood packaging material treatments (2006-015)
- Fruit fly treatments (2006-024)
- Soil and growing media in association with plants: treatments (2009-006)

Formal Objections

[12] The Secretariat introduced this issue⁵ and mentioned that a number of countries submitted formal objects⁶ on the fruit fly cold treatments currently up for adoption. Each treatment lead (and assistant lead) will consider the formal objects further and report back to the TPPT at its next face-to-face meeting (23-27 June 2014, Bali, Indonesia). It was noted that some of the points submitted by IPPC contracting parties as formal objections, were previously submitted 14-days prior CPM-8 (2013) for some draft treatments.

[13] For the purposes of supporting the SC discussion for the SC 2014 May meeting, the panel discussed the basis for these objections considering the following points:

[14] All populations of *Ceratatis capitata* (Medfly) are closely related, although Medfly itself is part of a species complex. The TPPT therefore considers it unlikely that differences in treatment outcomes are

³ CPM-9 meeting report (once available): <https://www.ippc.int/core-activities/governance/cpm>

⁴ *List of Topics for IPPC Standards*: <https://www.ippc.int/core-activities/standards-setting/list-topics-ippc-standards>

⁵ 03_TPPT_2014_Apr; 04_TPPT_2014_Apr; 05_TPPT_2014_Apr

⁶ <https://www.ippc.int/core-activities/standards-setting/formal-objections>

unlikely to be differences in population genetics. It was noted that many different methods were used in experimentation on cold (and other) treatment testing. These experimental differences probably play a much larger role in differences in treatment outcomes. This however does not resolve the problem of how to relate these different treatment experiments from different areas. This problem will be difficult to resolve and may require some of the experimental evidence to be discarded if found to generate inconsistent results. Further research could be completed on trying these issues if possible however this could apply to any of the treatments used internationally. It was noted that some of this issue was discussed in the Expert Consultation on Cold Treatments held in December 2013 in Buenos Aires, Argentina⁷.

[15] TPPTs role is to review the science/evidence supporting the claims made about the effectiveness of the treatment, it is up to countries to decide if they choose to use it or not. As has been made clear in past discussions, countries have no obligation to use or accept in trade a scientifically valid treatment however they should not be able to block the approval into ISPM 28 of that treatment if it is indeed valid. It was also noted that validity can be proven in one or one series of valid experiments presented in a single publication. The number of supporting publications should therefore not be considered in the criteria for adoption of a treatment.

[16] It was pointed out by the TPPT that, maybe it is not possible to have a complete knowledge of the efficacy of a given treatment the TPPT needs to make a recommendation based on the available data.

[17] TPPT noted that for some treatments it might need to have more scientific information. It was agreed that a draft document will be made to be presented at the next TPPT face-to-face meeting.

[18] The TPPT:

(2) *noted* the update from the CPM-9

(3) *assigned* the following treatment assistants:

- Cold treatment for *Ceratitidis capitata* on *Citrus sinensis* (2007-206A): Mr Scott MYERS
- Cold treatment for *Ceratitidis capitata* on *Citrus reticulata* x *Citrus sinensis* (2007-206B): Mr David REES
- Cold treatment for *Ceratitidis capitata* on *Citrus limon* (2007-206C): Mr Mike ORMSBY
- Cold treatment for *Bactrocera tryoni* on *Citrus sinensis* (2007-206E): Mr Scott MYERS
- Cold treatment for *Bactrocera tryoni* on *Citrus reticulata* x *Citrus sinensis* (2007-206F): Mr Scott MYERS
- Cold treatment for *Bactrocera tryoni* on *Citrus limon* (2007-206G): Mr Mike ORMSBY
- Cold treatment for *Ceratitidis capitata* on *Citrus paradisi* (2007-210): Mr David REES

(4) *considered* the formal objections received 14-days prior CPM-9 (2014)

(5) *agreed* to prepare a paper on the TPPT responses to the formal objections for the next face-to-face meeting.

Technical Panel for the Glossary (TPG)

ED definition

[19] The Secretariat introduced the issue⁸ and explained that the Technical Panel for the Glossary (TPG) analyzed the proposition on the Effective Dose (ED) definition and that the TPG proposed a new term. The TPG recommended the TPPT to:

⁷ Expert Consultation on Cold Treatments meeting report: <https://www.ippc.int/core-activities/standards-setting/expert-consultation-on-cold-treatments>

⁸ 03_TPPT_2014_Apr

- reconsider the definition and if necessary amend ISPM 28 to accommodate an alternative term; and
- consider how the definition would work in different FAO languages e.g. Efficacy of the Dose (ED).

[20] The TPPT discussed possible alternatives to accommodate the TPG comments. On the issue of the definition in other FAO languages, assistants were assigned within the TPPT to follow-up on this. TPPT members and Secretariat were assigned Ormsby (English), Secretariat (Russian, Arabic), Wang (Chinese), Eduardo (Spanish), Secretariat (French).

[21] The TPPT:

(6) *noted* the TPG update.

(7) *agreed* that a document on the *Effective dose (ED) definition* taking into account the TPG comments, will be prepared by the panel lead, for the next TPPT face-to-face meeting.

(8) *agreed* to send comments and propositions on the ED definition and send to Mr Mike Ormsby before the next TPPT face-to-face meeting.

(9) *assigned* the following assistants on the FAO languages:

- English: Mr Mike ORMSBY
- Chinese: Mr Yuejin WANG
- Spanish: Mr Eduardo WILLINK
- Russian, Arabic and French: IPPC Secretariat

TPG comments on Draft Annex to ISPM 28:2007: Irradiation for *Dysmicoccus Neobrevipes*, *Planococcus Lilacinus* and *Planococcus Minor* (2012-011)

[22] The TPPT considered that the TPG comments on the draft annex to ISPM 28 were appropriate and were incorporated by the treatment leads. The leads considered the treatment is ready for adoption.

[23] The TPPT:

(10) *noted* the update.

3. TPPT Work Programme

Update from treatment leads

[24] It was mentioned (see section 2 “Letters to submitters” above) that a comprehensive response was received from Australia on the Vapour heat treatment for *Bactrocera tryoni* on *Mangifera indica* (2010-107). This submission will be discussed further by the leads.

Update in TPPT work programme

[25] It was pointed out that many of the tasks have been completed on the work programme⁹. Of the remaining tasks; a number were combined and leads were assigned as follows:

- Heated air treatments and the development of a paper for consideration at the next TPPT face-to-face: Mr Guy HALLMAN (lead), Andrew JESSUP and Scott MYERS.
- TPPT working criteria for treatment evaluation: In order to ensure that all information from TPPT responses and discussion are consistent Mr Patrick GOMES was assigned the lead for this issue.

⁹ 03_TPPT_2014_Apr

- [26] The Secretariat will update the TPPT work programme with the agreed tasks as appropriate. The Secretariat noted the value of the TPPT responses to formal objections, working criteria and other documents being developed by the TPPT. It was pointed out that these documents will be presented to the SC to consider using, when appropriate, as background information to support the adoption of treatments.

4. Other Business

Instructions to assist in preparing complete submissions

- [27] The Secretariat recalled that in 2013 July meeting the TPPT agreed to reconsider the development of instructions for preparing complete submissions after the CPM-9 (2014) approves the List of topics for IPPC standards. It was mentioned that CPM-9 has agreed to the topics and the TPPT was invited to start development of instructions for preparing complete submissions.

- [28] The TPPT:

(11) *agreed* to invite Mr Mike ORMSBY to start working on a draft of instructions for preparing complete submissions for the next TPPT face-to-face meeting.

Preparation for the face-to-face meeting

- [29] It was informed by the Secretariat that an e-forum will be prepared for discussion and agreement on the agenda for the 2014 June TPPT meeting in Bali, Indonesia.

Next meeting date

- [30] The next TPPT meeting (face-to-face) was scheduled for 23-27 June 2014 in Bali, Indonesia. The Secretariat stressed that the deadline for submitting discussion papers is 1 June 2014.

5. Close of the Meeting and Feedback

- [31] The panel agreed to adopt the meeting report via a TPPT e-forum. The Secretariat thanked all the participants for their attention and work and closed the meeting.

Appendix 1: Agenda**2014 April TPPT Virtual Meeting****AGENDA**

AGENDA ITEM	DOCUMENT NO.	PRESENTER
1. Opening of the meeting	-	SHAMILOV
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Welcome by the IPPC Secretariat Virtual meeting information for Adobe Connect Introductions Adoption of the agenda and Election of Rapporteur 	02_TPPT_2014_Apr 01_TPPT_2014_Apr	SHAMILOV
2. Updates from relevant Bodies		SHAMILOV
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ❖ IPPC Secretariat • SC e-decisions on treatments for Member Consultation (MC) • Letters to Submitters ❖ CPM-9 (2014) • Adoption of International Standards for Phytosanitary Measures • Revision of List of Topics for IPPC Standards • Formal Objections ❖ Technical Panel for the Glossary (TPG) • ED definition • TPG comments on Draft Annex to ISPM 28:2007: Irradiation for <i>Dysmicoccus Neobrevipes</i>, <i>Planococcus Lilacinus</i> and <i>Planococcus Minor</i> (2012-011) 	03_TPPT_2014_Apr 04_TPPT_2014_Apr 05_TPPT_2014_Apr	SHAMILOV SHAMILOV PARKER
3. TPPT Work Programme		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Updated from treatments leads Update in TPPT work programme 	03_TPPT_2014_Apr	ALL / SHAMILOV
4. Other business	-	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ❖ Working TPPT criteria for treatment evaluation. ❖ Instructions to assist in preparing complete submissions ❖ Preparation for the face-to-face meeting • TPPT forum on Provisional Agenda for 2014 June TPPT meeting • Flight information • Visa preparation 	03_TPPT_2014_Apr	SHAMILOV
5. Close of the meeting and feedback	-	SHAMILOV

Appendix 2: TPPT Work Programme

TPPT work programme 2014

Updated: After 2014 January TPPT virtual meeting (strikethrough actions are done)

2014 DUE DATE	RESPONSIBLE	ACTION
16-23 Jan	All members	TPPT virtual meeting (Adobe Connect)
4 Feb	JESSUP	TPPT position paper on adult emergence after irradiation treatments Submitted to the Secretariat
3-10 Feb	All	Forum: 2014 January TPPT Virtual meeting report discussion
17-24 Feb	All	Forum: 2014 January TPPT meeting report approval
28 Feb	SHAMILOV	2014 January TPPT meeting report is posted
1 Apr	ORMSBY	Instruction to assist in proper and complete submissions
1 Apr	ORMSBY	Submit to the Secretariat Draft TPPT response on acceptance of treatments based on historical evidence
1 Apr	SHAMILOV	Send reminder for requests for information
29 Apr	ALL	TPPT virtual meeting
1 Mar	SHAMILOV	(After SC e-decision) Inform the submitter that only <i>Carica papaya</i> and <i>B. melanotus</i> and <i>B. xanthodes</i> were accepted for the (2009-105)
1 Mar	SHAMILOV	(After SC e-decision) Inform the submitter that only variety <i>Clemenules</i> was accepted for the 2010-102
1 May	ALL MEMBERS	Submissions of Data due for 2014 TPPT meeting
1 June	JESSUP/ORMSBY	TPPT guidance to the submitting country (2009-105) on research required to extend the treatment to other fruit flies and hosts of interest to them in international trade
1 Jun	ALL MEMBERS	Treatment portfolios, checklists, etc. due for 2014 TPPT meeting
1 Jun	PARKER/HALLMAN	TPPT response to the member Comments on Draft Annex to ISPM 28:2007: Irradiation for <i>Dysmicoccus neobrevipes</i> , <i>Planococcus lilacinus</i> and <i>Planococcus minor</i> (2012-011)
1 Jun	ALL MEMBERS	All discussion papers due for 2014 TPPT meeting
9 Jun	SHAMILOV	All documents posted for 2014 TPPT meeting
23-27 June	All members	2014 TPPT Meeting (Indonesia)